Session CS4.3: Aligning Requirements & Good Conservation Practice – Handout

Friday, October 13, 2017 (3:00 PM – 4:30 PM)
Room: Confederation III - Level 4

Session Description:

Places of cultural heritage value are identified, protected, preserved and managed according to a range of local, provincial/state and federal heritage conservation policies, guidelines and regulations. However, there are additional life safety, land use and environmental policy and regulatory frameworks that apply to all real property (including cultural heritage / historic sites) that sometimes may not integrate with or support the objectives of heritage conservation. This session will identify a number of potential conflicts and explore innovative approaches to overcoming these challenges. Presenters will share experiences in cultural landscape preservation, disaster management planning, land use planning/infill design, and building rehabilitation and restoration.

Session Learning Objectives:

- Identify some of the common regulatory and policy barriers to heritage conservation
- understand and describe successful approaches to integrating conservation objectives with land use planning, building code and other policy and regulatory requirements
- demonstrate an awareness of how project scale, jurisdiction and heritage property typology can inform policy/regulatory requirements
- recognize how public policy and regulatory frameworks can be enhanced to encourage heritage conservation

Session audience: policy planners, land use planners, and heritage planners, watershed and environmental regulators, architects, and engineers.

Session Chair:
Sean Fraser, CAHP, Director, Programs & Operations, Ontario Heritage Trust (Toronto)

First Presenter:
Rebecca Sciarra, MA, CAHP, Partner and Cultural Heritage Specialist, ASI (Toronto)

Presentation Title:
Policies, Regulations and Projects for Promoting Large Landscape Conservation

This presentation will focus on the intersection between regulations, guidelines and policies that help foster a culture of conservation by looking at the Credit River Valley in the Province of Ontario. The Credit River flows from headwaters above the Niagara Escarpment and drains down into Lake Ontario at Port Credit. It has, and continues to function as a complex landscape that is intimately linked to its natural setting and cultural features and processes. It also functions as a landscape that resonates in people's imaginations and memories. Its beauty has been rendered on canvases and its waters bear witness to the different communities that have thrived on its banks. It too is part of our contemporary urban and peri-urban fabric in the Greater Toronto Area.

This presentation will examine the overlapping regulations, guidelines and policies that have been developed for this watershed at municipal, regional, and provincial levels for the purposes of sensitively managing and protecting its ecological, cultural and recreational values. The presentation will show how these tools have established a rich policy framework for conserving the Credit River Valley and promoted broad based mobilization around its assets that form an integral part of the public realm.

The presentation will explore this complex regulatory environment as an example of the rich opportunities that are possible when multi-jurisdictional, large scale landscape management occurs. The presentation will then drill down into select conservation projects that have emerged within the Credit River Valley and which have been supported and inspired by the confluence of these various regulations and policies that overlap and which are enacted at various levels of government. Two examples illustrate the conservation 'wins' that are emerging within this landscape and which flow out of this comprehensive policy framework:

- A strategic conservation plan for a highway bridge located within the valley
- Interpretative plan developed to communicate the Indigenous cultural record associated with the river and valley system

Presentation Learning Objectives:

- Identify statutes such as the Planning Act, Conservation Authority Act, and the Greenbelt Act, including associated regulatory instruments and policies that can be well suited for large-scale landscape conservation.
- Critically assess the different regulatory approaches and stakeholders that together can promote inter-jurisdictional landscape conservation.
- Identify specific contemporary conservation projects that promote cultural heritage conservation within a watershed.
- Describe the conservation opportunities that are possible when policy objectives intersect between active transportation, ecological protection, sustainability, public realm planning, cultural heritage conservation, and effective stakeholder engagement.

Second Presenter:
Nina M. Jean-Louis, E.I.T., Structural Engineering Associate, Historic Preservation Graduate Student, Pratt Institute / Associate, WJE (Washington, DC)

Presentation Title:
The Integration of Heritage Conservation and Flood Mitigation Protection

In October of 2012, Hurricane Sandy brought unprecedented damage to many coastal communities throughout New York and New Jersey. One community, Mantoloking, NJ, saw roughly 60% of its buildings severely damaged, partly submerged and displaced from original building foundations. Many of these buildings were located in two historic districts where the historic and cultural resources lost lacked heritage documentation detailing its significance in the community. Situations, such as in Mantoloking, challenge not only the idea of permanence, but also the idea of climate change being a looming threat. The impacts of climate change that include sea-level rise, storm surge as well as intensified and more frequent storm events are happening now and affecting the lives, places and cultural heritage that surround us.

In an effort to better prepare communities in responding, recovering, and mitigating the adverse effects of such disasters, U.S. state and local governments, under the Disaster Mitigation Act, have devised disaster mitigation plans. However, many of these plans lack identifying pre-and

post-disaster needs to protect historical and cultural resources from natural disasters. Moreover, the same is reflected in state and local historic preservation plans as most do not consider natural hazards as threat to be addressed in their goals and objectives.

Often these two policy sectors are treated separately, though, both aim to protect the life and property from damages caused by such hazards. In order to analyze the incorporation of heritage conservation & preservation into state disaster mitigation plans for flood protection, this research will first investigate existing policy and guidance connecting the two fields on a federal level. This investigation will broaden the understanding of existing federal guidance on the issue and reveal how states can leverage this information into their own planning. Moreover, this research will seek to identify the policy conflicts that act as potential barriers to effectively connect the two disciplines. From this analysis, a set of solutions will be proposed on how to successfully incorporate heritage conservation and preservation principles into flood resiliency planning.

Presentation Learning Objectives:

- Identify what U.S. federal policies and programs exist to provide guidance on how to integrate the two disciplines
- Understand the significance in implementing heritage conservation into state disaster mitigation planning as well as its possible preventative benefits though the case studies discussed
- Distinguish what policy conflicts have contributed to the disconnection between the two disciplines
- Recognize the solutions that will integrate the two disciplines and also identify the evaluative criteria necessary to ensure its effectiveness through case studies succeeding in this effort

Third Presenter:
David Wise, MUP, MCIP, RPP, Program Manager, Zoning & Interpretation, Planning and Development, City of Ottawa (Ottawa)

Presentation Title: ***Regulating Character – A review of the effectiveness of the Ottawa Mature Neighbourhoods Bylaw on protecting streetscape character***

In 2015 the City of Ottawa passed the Mature Neighbourhoods Overlay By-law 2012-147 that affects all residential dwellings of four storeys or less in the older neighbourhoods in the inner core of Ottawa, focusing on “streetcar-age” mature neighbourhoods. The purpose of the rules is to recognize the main character along a street and ensure that new development fits into the look along that street. The intent of this by-law (and the companion Infill II by-law) is to capture what is meant by the term ‘character’ in zoning terms and to mitigate land use impacts that may be experienced when new dwellings and additions are introduced into existing residential neighbourhoods. This does not mean whether the architectural features or building materials are similar to those of neighbouring properties, but rather provide focus on the key attributes of landscaping, massing, location, and front yard parking. Two years have passed, and the City is now looking at how these new rules have impacted development in the targeted neighbourhoods, considering the effectiveness of this program, and what the next steps may be.

Session CS4.3: Aligning Requirements & Good Conservation Practice – Handout

Presentation Learning Objectives:

- Learn how the City of Ottawa has defined and regulated streetscape character
- Understand the statutory authority under the Planning Act for protection of mature neighborhoods
- Demonstrate how the City of Ottawa is implementing this process in mature neighbourhoods
- Learn about the next steps in the City's process

Fourth Presenter:
Robin Whitehurst, AIA, Principal, Bailey Edward Design, Inc. (Chicago)

Presentation Title: ***Restoration Amidst Regulation.***

Conservation for public buildings is complex; complying with numerous codes and standards requires careful resolution of inherent conflicts with restoration and preservation. Oftentimes, multiple authorities having jurisdiction have needs in conflict with meeting the needs of multiple levels of users. Sustainability goals and health/life safety codes, in particular, pose challenges to the goal of conservation and retention of historic building fabric. Heritage buildings owned by public agencies are often victims of deferred maintenance and multiple campaigns of well-meaning but errant preservation or restoration projects, adding to the challenges of the project. Using two case studies, this presentation will illustrate creative resolution of the above challenges, while simultaneously restoring the significant historic features, and meeting or exceeding sustainability goals.

The first project is the rehabilitation of Lincoln Hall for the University of Illinois, which achieved LEED Platinum certification; the second is an armory for the Department of Military Affairs, which achieved LEED Silver certification, all typical building standards, as well as blast resistance for force protection. The case studies will outline the client programmatic requirements; cover the standards that had to be met, and the methodology for resolving these issues. In particular:

- Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Historic Rehabilitation
- Client standards (University facility standards, minimum military requirements, LEED sustainability goals)
- Modernization of building infrastructure
- Public procurement requirements
- Building, accessibility, seismic and International Energy Code requirements

As will be demonstrated with the case studies, a focus on the core mission of the building and its historic significance, and generating insightful design solutions, facilitated resolution of these conflicts, providing lessons learned which other professionals could apply to their future work.

Presentation Learning Objectives:

- Understand how the mission of the building program leads the project design objectives.
- Identify codes and standards which must be balanced when working with historic buildings.
- Understand some approaches to balancing the historic fabric with the change of use.
- Understand creative approaches to sustainable building design